



Town of Yountville

6550 Yount Street
Yountville, CA 94599

Staff Report

Item #: 1

Zoning and Design Review Board Staff Report

DATE: February 9, 2021

TO: Board Members

FROM: Daniel Gordon, Planning Manager

Applicant: Jacob Evans

Owner: Jacob & Kimberly Evans

Location: 2150 Starkey Avenue; APN 036-034-006

Land Use Classification: OTH Old Town Historic

SUBJECT:

Design Review to raze an existing residence and construct a new single-family residence at 2150 Starkey Avenue.

PROJECT SITE

The subject parcel is an approximately 3,301 square foot lot on the north side of Starkey Avenue. The applicant proposes to raze the existing residence and construct a new two-story single-family residence of approximately 990 square feet and a semi-enclosed garage. The existing residence (c. 1895) is not included in the Town's Historic Resource Inventory, is in a dilapidated condition, and rehabilitation of the structure is not feasible given the advanced state of deterioration.

Proposed Single-Family Residence

The proposed new single-family residence will be sited towards the center of the parcel. A detached semi-enclosed garage is proposed for the rear of the parcel in the northwest corner.

Siding for the lower level of the residence and the semi-enclosed garage is McNear Tivoli Facebrick. Siding for the 2nd story is horizontal wood siding in Duxbury Gray. Matte black steel is proposed for the window and door casings with black belly trim and wood louvers.

The front door is solid wood. Materials and colors are shown on the attached exterior renderings. Architectural elements include a covered wooden front porch of approximately 191 square feet (including entryway) with decorative wooden columns, exposed stained wooden rafters supporting the roof over the porch, and stained wooden beams supporting the 2nd story balconette on the cantilevered building section.

A gable roof with a dormer window and a 5:12 pitch is proposed. Roofing will be weathered zinc corrugated metal. Second floor plate height for the main residence is 19'-7". Overall height for the main residence will be 23'-2" and overall height of the semi-enclosed garage/second dwelling will be 11'-1.5".

Front setbacks will be 20'-0". Side setbacks will be 5' (east) and 5' (west). Second story side setbacks will be 8' (east) and 8' (west). The rear setback will be 20' for the residence.

The semi-enclosed garage will be sited at the rear of the parcel and setback 5' from the west side of the parcel and 5' from the rear of the parcel. The semi-enclosed garage maintains a 6' eave-to-eave separation between the primary residence. The driveway surface will be decomposed granite.

Landscape and Tree Preservation Plan.

A comprehensive landscape plan will be submitted for the Board's review at a later date. 5 trees are proposed for removal. They are all fruit trees whose size falls below the requirement for a tree removal application.

The following table provides the proposed development conditions and compares them to the Code requirements:

DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS			
		CODE REQUIREMENT	PROPOSED
	PRIMARY DWELLING		
SETBACKS	FRONT (NORTH) for buildings over 18'	20' minimum	20'
	FRONT (NORTH) for porch	10' minimum	13'-5"
	SIDE (EAST) – 1 st FLOOR	5' minimum	5'
	SIDE (EAST) – 2 nd FLOOR	8' minimum	8'
	SIDE (WEST) – 1 st FLOOR	5' minimum	5'
	SIDE (WEST) – 2 nd FLOOR	8' minimum	8'
	REAR (SOUTH)	20' minimum	20'
BUILDING HEIGHT		20' maximum plate	19'-7"
		28' maximum total	24'-5"
TWO STORY BUILDINGS	Existing one-story SFRs on Jefferson: 7	No more than 50% of the single-family dwelling units on any given block are permitted to be two-story (both sides of street and corner houses are counted).	Two-story. The block will have 6 one-story homes and 4 two-story homes. More than 50% of single-family dwelling units on this block remain one-story.
	Existing two-story SFRs on Jefferson: 3 (does not include 6630 Jefferson)		

SEMI-ENCLOSED GARAGE			
SETBACKS	FRONT (NORTH)	18' minimum	45'-10"

	REAR (SOUTH)	5' minimum	5'
	SIDE (WEST)	5' minimum	5'
HEIGHT		20' maximum plate, 28' maximum total	11'-1.5" total height
FAR			
MAXIMUM		A base floor area of 1000 square feet is allowed for lots up to 4000 square feet in Old Town	998 square feet
EXEMPTIONS	SEMI-ENCLOSED GARAGE	Up to 400 sq ft	282 square feet
	INTERIOR STAIRWELL	One-half of stairwell	12 square feet

DISCUSSION/ANALYSIS

Development Standards The proposed residence substantially complies with the Design Ordinance standards for setbacks, plate and building height, FAR, accessory structures, exterior finish materials, building orientation, and building elements on the primary facade. In addition, the proposed development substantially complies with the following design guidelines that are specific to the Old Town Historic design district:

- Roofs.
 - At 5:12, roofing exceeds the minimum recommended pitch of 4:12. The semi-enclosed garage has a parapet roof.
 - Weathered zinc corrugated metal roofing is proposed for all structures, which is an acceptable material according to the Town's Design Guidelines.
- Garages.
 - The semi-enclosed garage is located towards the rear of the parcel and will have little visual impact from Starkey Street. It is accessed via a driveway of decomposed granite. Located over 40 feet from the front elevation at Starkey Street, it exceeds the minimum 18-foot required setback. It is a one-car semi-enclosed garage with wide wooden slats that act as a door. The semi-enclosed garage's overall design is sympathetic to the main residence. It is a detached garage, which is encouraged in Old Town. Of note: the garage does not have a solid door but rather wide wooden slats. This may give the appearance of a trash enclosure rather than a garage.
- Exterior Colors.
 - The proposed exterior materials (unpainted brick, painted gray wooden siding, and black trim) are consistent with the preference for muted and soft colors that are compatible with Old Town.
- Windows and Doors.
 - This residence has as mixture of black metal picture windows and divided-light windows. Many feature a 1½:1 height to width ratio, which is preferred. The other windows are proportional for the locations or elevations on which they are placed. Second-story windows that face neighboring have been placed higher up to minimize privacy concerns. The second-story bathroom master

bath window that faces the neighbors to the west is obscured by wooden lattice work. Sliding glass doors are proposed for the balconette off the master bedroom facing the street.

- Front Porches.
 - A 191 square foot front porch and entryway is proposed. It is 6'8" deep and set back 13'4" from the front property line, fulfilling the preference in the municipal code for a prominent front porch.
- Exterior Materials.
 - The proposed contemporary design draws on craftsman elements which are present (if not common) throughout Old Town. While brick and masonry are more frequently found in commercial areas of town, the lower-level brick siding does also have precedent as a design feature in residential areas. However, the amount proposed for this residence makes it a dominant rather than an accent feature. Whether this feature and its intensity are appropriate for the property in question is a matter for the board.
- Landscaping.
 - The applicant will submit a comprehensive landscaping plan for the board's review at a later date.
- Driveways.
 - The proposed driveway is decomposed granite. This is a permeable material and satisfies the town standard. The transition apron is concrete, also satisfying the standard.

The above requirements are specific to Old Town. There are additional requirements that apply to all residential developments.

Parking Standards: Single-family residential uses are required to provide one covered and one screened parking space.

- The one-car semi-enclosed garage and one independently-accessible driveway space fulfill the code requirements.

However, staff does have concern that the overall design does not blend in well with Old Town's context and neighborhood character. Specifically, this is due to the following design features:

1. The cantilevered section over the driveway. This type of "floating" design feature is not present in Old Town.
2. The heavy building massing. The small lot, FAR allowance, ability to have two stories, and cantilevered building section contribute to a building massing that is unlike most residences in Old Town, which have low, rectangular massing.
3. Use and intensity of masonry. While other residences in Old Town do use masonry as an accent feature, the amount proposed for this residence makes it a dominant design feature, which is not common in Old Town.
4. The municipal code states that "Every effort shall be made to blend in with the adjacent neighborhood (both sides of the block, including corner houses), rather than stand out as unique or singular in style." (18.20.010). Staff met with the applicant's architect and explained how many of the design features were not in keeping with neighborhood character and the Old Town design guidelines in the municipal code. While changes were made to the initial design to better conform to these guidelines, they were largely minor in scope and so this concern remains.
5. In combination, these elements possibly create a "breakout design." According to the municipal code, "New structures shall not reference outside architectural styles or breakout designs" (18.20.010). The term "breakout design" is not defined in the code, and so this determination is a matter for the board.

Staff does note that there can be significant challenges to developing a lot of this size. At 3,301 square feet, it is one of the smallest lots in town. However, the concerns about overall design remain, despite the fact that this

project substantially complies with the Town's design guidelines.

Staff has not included proposed findings for this project and asks that the board provide feedback on the issues raised above.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorically Exempt per California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guideline; Class 3, New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures

STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL

Is item Identified in Strategic Plan? Yes

If yes, Identify Strategic Goal and Objective. **Quality of Life:** The Town enhances the livability of Yountville by providing well-maintained public facilities, parks, and trails, and quality programs and events.

Briefly Explain Relationship to Strategic Plan Goal and Objective. By participating in design review, the Town ensures new developments comply with municipal code requirements, helping maintain the Town's quality of life.

RECOMMENDATION

Receive staff report and direct questions to staff.

Receive the applicant's presentation.

Conduct public hearing and receive testimony.

Conduct ZDRB discussion on 2150 Starkey Street.

Provide feedback and direction to staff and the applicant based on the issues staff has raised in the staff report.